

**Community Advisory Council**  
**May 14, 2009**  
**Action Items/Notes**

*Final*

These notes are in the following order:

1. Attendance
2. Correspondence and Handouts
3. Administrative Items
4. Vicki Colvin Presentation on Nanotechnology
5. Agenda Setting
6. Community Comment
7. SPDES Permit Recommendation

### **1. Attendance**

Members/Alternates Present:  
See Attached Sheets.

Others Present:

S. Aronson, D. Bauer, M. Bebon, C. Birben, p. Bond, N. Canavor, H. Carrano, J. Carter, J. D'Ascoli, N. Detweiler, L. Garber, M. Holland, S. Johnson, M. Lynch, M. Madigan, R. McKay, L. Ormand, JP Perkins, J. Petschauer, R. Sabatino

### **2. Correspondence and Handouts**

Items one through four were mailed with a cover letter dated May 8, 2009. Items five and six were placed in members folders and item seven was available as a handout at the meeting.

1. May 14, 2009 draft agenda
2. Draft notes for April 15, 2009
3. Final notes for March 12, 2009
4. Information on Vicki Colvin
5. Copy of a response to CAC letter to DOE re BNL contract competition dated April 8, 2009 from Michael D. Hill.
6. Copy of draft CAC recommendation on Lab's SPDES permit modifications
7. Copy of BNL Bulletin featuring articles on Nanoscience Safety and Vicki Colvin.

### **3. Administrative Items**

The meeting began at 6:39 p.m. Reed Hodgkin reviewed the ground rules and the draft agenda. Those in attendance introduced themselves.

Approval of Minutes

Quorum not met.

### **4. Presentation on Nanotechnology, Dr. Vicki Colvin**

Dr. Vicki Colvin, Director, Center for Biological and Environmental Nanotechnology, Professor of Chemistry, Rice University, Houston, Texas gave the CAC a presentation on nanotechnology. She explained the basic facts of nanotechnology and discussed the safety of engineered nanomaterials and managing risk. She described nanotechnology and the work being done in the field. She said that risk equals hazard times exposure and that new technology is needed. She posed questions such as: Are engineered nanoparticles safe; and How can we engineer safe nanoparticles; and explained her theories. She told the CAC that nanotechnology presents a huge array of unknown risks, but also offers solutions to our most pressing social problems. CAC members asked many questions.

An audio copy of Dr. Colvin's full presentation, including the questions and answers, will be available on CD to CAC members at the June meeting.

## 5. Agenda Setting

Jeanne D'Ascoli, liaison to the CAC, said that next month there will be an annual update on the Peconic River with last year's findings. There will also be a brief presentation on the Record of Decision (ROD) for the High Flux Beam Reactor (HFBR), including how the CAC's input was used in the ROD. The Laboratory would also like to discuss the CAC's interest in taking a break this summer in either July or August, or both.

John Carter, DOE, said the ROD for the HFBR has been finalized. There will be a Notice of Availability in tomorrow's Newsday. The ROD will be available on the BNL webpage ([http://www.bnl.gov/hfbr/Docs/HFBR\\_Final\\_ROD.pdf](http://www.bnl.gov/hfbr/Docs/HFBR_Final_ROD.pdf)), and copies will be sent out electronically to all CAC members.

**ACTION ITEM:** E-mail ROD to CAC members.

Member Blumer asked if CAC members could visit the Peconic River before the next meeting. She also asked if it would be possible to have a scientist from the outside that had previously gone with them join them again.

D'Ascoli asked if any other members are interested in taking a field trip to the Peconic River to see the progress that's been made. Several CAC members raised their hands to indicate their interest. She said she would check to see if any of the scientists that had gone before were available to join them again on this visit.

**ACTION ITEM:** Schedule a field trip to the Peconic River.

Reed asked for a show of hands to see how many CAC members were interested in taking off part of the summer. Only one member raised their hand, so Reed said, it appears the CAC would like to keep going along if there is a reason to do so.

Member Mannhaupt asked if the month of August could be used as a brainstorming session, as was done previously. She said they could discuss possible topics and where they would like to go as a CAC.

Reed asked the rest of the members if it would be okay to use the month of August as a strategic session, brainstorming ideas for the future. The CAC agreed. He said it may be necessary to add something else to the agenda depending on what is pressing at that time.

## 6. Community Comment

There was no community comment.

## **7. State Pollutant Discharge Elimination System (SPDES) Permit Recommendation**

Reed said that since quorum was not met, it is not possible to develop a consensus recommendation. However, there can be input from the CAC to the permitting process. A sense of the CAC can be developed that is not a formal recommendation. He said that during the intervening weeks from last month's meeting, member Esposito, (Citizen's Campaign for the Environment) drafted comments on the permit modifications and sent that in to the Laboratory. Jeanne D'Ascoli circulated those comments to the CAC members and received a number of excellent comments back. Those comments were then incorporated and there is now a draft recommendation that has been developed by a number of members. Seven CAC members responded by e-mail to the first draft either in support or in support with a comment, and another four members e-mailed support for the second version. He asked the CAC members present review the draft recommendation and comment on it.

The following is the draft recommendation that was presented to the CAC:

**Community Advisory Council Recommendation  
on the State Pollution Discharge Elimination System (SPDES)  
Permit Modification Comment Period for the Draft Permit Issued by  
New York State Department of Environmental Conservation on February 9, 2009.**

The Community Advisory Council (CAC) welcomes the opportunity to comment on the proposed changes for Brookhaven National Laboratory's SPDES permit. BNL has 12 SPDES permitted outfalls which include discharge to both groundwater and surface water.

The draft SPDES permit calls for significant changes in the discharge from the Sewage Treatment Plant into the Peconic River. The CAC agrees with the interim limits established for six metals, copper, iron, lead, mercury, nickel, and zinc, until the new target limits can be established. However, the final limits will be developed pending the results of additional study and analysis. These studies will assess various options for identifying and providing treatment or alternative disposal options. Therefore, it is not reasonable for us to comment on a specific course of action without the results of these additional assessments. The results of these studies should be made available to the public, and specifically, to the BNL Community Advisory Council.

The pending studies and results are necessary to provide meaningful input into the SPDES permit process and the SPDES permit should be reopened upon completion of the agreed upon studies. The CAC believes that they cannot adequately comment on such critical issues as recommending redirection or reduced flow of the STP discharge without more comprehensive information regarding the many potential impacts to water quantity and quality within the Peconic River system. The CAC would like to have the opportunity to assess these options and impacts against any and all other treatment options available including upgrades to the STP.

The CAC believes the additional opportunity to comment requested after the completion of all of the studies is essential to provide substantive input into this important process. The knowledge from the studies on the full range of options will assist us, and the public, in making recommendations for the best environmental outcome.

Reed explained that the process of consensus recommendation is not based on majority vote, but on identifying whether the key interests of the members of the group are met. He asked if any CAC members have a key interest that is not met by this recommendation. No one indicated that their interests were not met. He then said that the sense of the CAC, not a consensus recommendation, including the members that agreed through e-mail, is that this represents a recommendation that the members of the CAC would like to put forward. He then asked if there any additional individual comments that anyone would like to be included with this recommendation. There were none. Reed expressed his appreciation to the members that took the time to draft something that so well represented the CAC's opinion and perspectives. Member Shea expressed her thanks to Member Esposito and those who worked on the recommendation. The CAC agreed.

Member Martin reported that the Custer Observatory in Southold is having a First Light party to celebrate a new telescope at 7 p.m. this Saturday. He then introduced Greg Bush, a professor at Suffolk County Community College, who will be replacing Audrey Capozzi as an alternate representing education. Greg Bush said he teaches economics at SCCC and lives in Northport. He is looking forward to joining the CAC and making a positive contribution.

The meeting adjourned at 8:54 p.m.

| Agenda Topics  | Votes |
|--|-------|
| Global Warming, Stony Brook, Pine Barrens (1-10-08)          | 15    |
| CAC as a conduit/resource to the community (11-08-07)        | 13    |
| Emergency Operations Center tour and drill (6-12-08)         | 12    |
| Nano technology (Colvin presentation 5-14-09)                | 11    |
| CERN—problems and implications (4-10-08)                     | 11    |
| Site Environment Report—good and bad (11-8-07)(10-2-08)      | 11    |
| Nano safety (3-13-08)  | 10    |
| Regulator presentations on areas they oversee                | 10    |
| Energy   | 9     |
| Overview of programs   | 9     |
| Deer Management (4-10-08)                                    | 8     |
| Anti-terrorism update  | 7     |
| NSLS-II briefing (12/11/08)                                  | 7     |
| Nuclear power plant safety                                   | 6     |
| Education Programs (10-2-08)                                 | 6     |
| Energy efficiencies (9-13-07)                                | 6     |
| Sustainable transportation                                   | 4     |
| Natural Resources management (11-13-08)                      | 4     |
| Nano ES & H (10-11-07)                                       | 3     |
| Safety and Security  | 3     |
| Experimental Review Process                                  | 3     |
| Latest RHIC findings   | 2     |
| How the Lab supports nuclear facilities in the N/E region    | 2     |
| Status of P-2 road show                                      | 2     |
| Heating plant and efficiency research (12-11-08)             | 2     |
| Lyme Disease   | 2     |
| CAC process  | 2     |
| Alternative fuels  | 2     |
| Update on phyto/bacterial contamination remediation research | 1     |
| Deforestation  | 0     |
| Work planning process  | 0     |

#### New Topics Added After September 2007 Vote

~~Global warming—BNL research (5-8-08)~~  
~~Nano toxicology (5-14-09)~~  
~~Nano ES&H issues at BNL and beyond (5-8-08)~~  
 Nanotechnology/science at BNL  
~~Nano management policy issues (5-14-09)~~  
 Nano panel discussion with the DOE, EPA, and FDA  
 Renewable energy research at the Lab  
 BNL/CSHarbor/Stony Brook collaboration

| <b>P = Present</b> | <b>2009</b> | <b>Affiliation</b>  |           | First Name | Last Name    | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | June | July | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec |
|--------------------|-------------|---|-----------|------------|--------------|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|------|------|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|
|                    |             | ABCO (Garber added on 4/10/02)  | Member    | Don        | Garber       | P   | P   | P   | P   | P   |      |      |     |     |     |     |     |
|                    |             | ABCO  | Alternate |            |              |     |     |     |     |     |      |      |     |     |     |     |     |
|                    |             | Brookhaven Retired Employees Association  | Member    | Graham     | Campbell     | P   | P   | P   | P   | P   |      |      |     |     |     |     |     |
|                    |             | Brookhaven Retired Employees Association (L. Jacobson new alternate as of 4/99)(A. Peskin 5/04)                                   | Alternate | Arnie      | Peskin       | P   |     |     |     | P   |      |      |     |     |     |     |     |
|                    |             |   |           |            |              |     |     |     |     |     |      |      |     |     |     |     |     |
|                    |             |   |           |            |              |     |     |     |     |     |      |      |     |     |     |     |     |
|                    |             | CHEC (Community Health & Environment Coalition (added 10/04)  | Member    | Sarah      | Anker        |     |     |     |     |     |      |      |     |     |     |     |     |
|                    |             | (added 12/08)   |           | Robert     | Andrejkovics | P   |     | P   | P   |     |      |      |     |     |     |     |     |
|                    |             | Citizens Campaign for the Environment   | Member    | Adrienne   | Esposito     | P   | P   | P   | P   |     |      |      |     |     |     |     |     |
|                    |             | Citizens Campaign for the Environment (Ottney added 4/02-takenoff 1/05 Mahoney put on)(7/06 add Kasey Jacobs)(K. Jacobs off 1/08) | Alternate |            |              |     |     |     |     |     |      |      |     |     |     |     |     |
|                    |             | E. Yaphank Civic Association  | Member    | Michael    | Giacomaro    |     |     | P   | P   | P   |      |      |     |     |     |     |     |
|                    |             | E. Yaphank Civic Association (J. Minasi new alternate as of 3/99) (M. Triber 11/05) (Munson 6/06) (Feinman 2/09)                  | Alternate | Bob        | Feinman      |     | P   | P   |     | P   |      |      |     |     |     |     |     |
|                    |             | Educator (changed 7/2006)   | Member    | Adam       | Martin       |     |     |     |     |     |      |      |     |     |     |     |     |
|                    |             | Educator (B. Martin - 9/01)   | Alternate | Bruce      | Martin       |     |     |     |     | P   |      |      |     |     |     |     |     |
|                    |             | Educator (A. Martin new alternate 2/00) (Adam to college 8/01)(add. alternate 9/02) (changed 7/2006)(Bush 5/09)                   | Alternate | Greg       | Bush         |     |     |     |     | P   |      |      |     |     |     |     |     |
|                    |             | Environmental Economic Roundtable (Berger resigned, Proios became member 1/01)(Proios resigned 6/08)                              | Member    | George     | Proios       |     |     |     |     |     |      |      |     |     |     |     |     |
|                    |             | Environmental Economic Roundtable (3/99, L. Snead changed to be alternate for EDF)  | Alternate | None       | None         |     |     |     |     |     |      |      |     |     |     |     |     |
|                    |             | Fire Rescue and Emergency Services  | Member    | Joe        | Williams     |     |     |     |     |     |      |      |     |     |     |     |     |
|                    |             | Fire Rescue and Emergency Services  | Alternate | Don        | Lynch        | P   | P   | P   |     |     |      |      |     |     |     |     |     |
|                    |             | Fire Rescue and Emergency Services  | Alternate | James      | McLoughlin   |     |     |     |     |     |      |      |     |     |     |     |     |
|                    |             | Friends of Brookhaven (E.Kaplan changed to become member 7/1/01)  | Member    | Ed         | Kaplan       |     | P   | P   |     |     |      |      |     |     |     |     |     |
|                    |             | Friends of Brookhaven (E.Kaplan changed to become member 7/1/01)(Schwartz added 11/18/02)   | Alternate | Steve      | Schwartz     | P   |     |     | P   | P   |      |      |     |     |     |     |     |
|                    |             | Health Care   | Member    | Jane       | Corrarino    |     |     | P   | P   |     |      |      |     |     |     |     |     |
|                    |             | Health Care   | Alternate |            |              |     |     |     |     |     |      |      |     |     |     |     |     |
|                    |             | Huntington Breast Cancer Coalition  | Member    | Mary Joan  | Shea         | P   | P   | P   | P   | P   |      |      |     |     |     |     |     |
|                    |             | Huntington Breast Cancer Coalition  | Alternate | Scott      | Carlin       |     |     | P   |     |     |      |      |     |     |     |     |     |

| <b>P = Present</b> | <b>2009</b> | <b>Affiliation</b>   |           | <b>First Name</b> | <b>Last Name</b> | <b>Jan</b> | <b>Feb</b> | <b>Mar</b> | <b>Apr</b> | <b>May</b>             | <b>June</b> | <b>July</b> | <b>Aug</b> | <b>Sep</b> | <b>Oct</b> | <b>Nov</b> | <b>Dec</b> |
|--------------------|-------------|--|-----------|-------------------|------------------|------------|------------|------------|------------|------------------------|-------------|-------------|------------|------------|------------|------------|------------|
|                    |             | Intl. Brotherhood of Electrical Workers/Local 2230 (S.Krsnak replaced M. Walker 1/11/07) | Member    | Scott             | Krsnak           | P          |            | P          |            |                        |             |             |            |            |            |            |            |
|                    |             | IBEW/Local 2230  | Alternate | Philip            | Pizzo            |            |            |            |            |                        |             |             |            |            |            |            |            |
|                    |             | L.I. Pine Barrens Society  | Member    | Richard           | Amper            | P          |            |            | P          |                        |             |             |            |            |            |            |            |
|                    |             | L.I. Pine Barrens Society (added P. Loris 6/05)(Alayeva off 6/08) (Itriyeva 02/09)       | Alternate | Irina             | Itriyeva         |            | P          | P          |            |                        |             |             |            |            |            |            |            |
|                    |             | L.I. Pine Barrens Society  | Alternate | Susie             | Husted           |            |            |            |            |                        |             |             |            |            |            |            |            |
|                    |             | L.I. Progressive Coalition   | Member    | David             | Sprintzen        | P          | P          |            | P          | (P - On speaker phone) |             |             |            |            |            |            |            |
|                    |             | L.I. Progressive Coalition   | Alternate | None              | None             |            |            |            |            |                        |             |             |            |            |            |            |            |
|                    |             | Lake Panamoka Civic Association (Biss as of 4/02)  | Member    | Rita              | Biss             | P          |            | P          |            | P                      |             |             |            |            |            |            |            |
|                    |             | Lake Panamoka Civic Association (Rita Biss new alternate as of 3/99)                     | Alternate | Joe               | Gibbons          |            |            |            |            |                        |             |             |            |            |            |            |            |
|                    |             | Long Island Association (Groneman replace 10/05)   | Member    |                   |                  |            |            |            |            |                        |             |             |            |            |            |            |            |
|                    |             | Long Island Association  | Alternate | William           | Evanzia          |            |            |            | P          |                        |             |             |            |            |            |            |            |
|                    |             | Longwood Alliance  | Member    | Tom               | Talbot           | P          | P          |            |            | P                      |             |             |            |            |            |            |            |
|                    |             | Longwood Alliance  | Alternate | Kevin             | Crowley          |            |            |            |            |                        |             |             |            |            |            |            |            |
|                    |             | Longwood Central School Dist. (switched 11/02)   | Member    | Barbara           | Henigin          |            |            | P          |            | P                      |             |             |            |            |            |            |            |
|                    |             | Longwood Central School Dist.  | Alternate | Allan             | Gerstenlauer     |            |            |            |            |                        |             |             |            |            |            |            |            |
|                    |             | NEAR   | Member    | Jean              | Mannhaupt        | P          |            |            |            | P                      |             |             |            |            |            |            |            |
|                    |             | NEAR (prospect taken off ¾) (Blumer added 10/04)   | Alternate | Karen             | Blumer           |            |            | P          |            | P                      |             |             |            |            |            |            |            |
|                    |             | NSLS User  | Member    | Jean              | Jordan-Sweet     | P          | P          | P          | P          | P                      |             |             |            |            |            |            |            |
|                    |             | NSLS User  | Alternate | Peter             | Stephens         |            |            |            |            |                        |             |             |            |            |            |            |            |
|                    |             | Peconic River Sportsman's Club (added 4/8/04)  | Member    | John              | Hall             | P          |            |            |            |                        |             |             |            |            |            |            |            |
|                    |             | Peconic River Sportsman's Club   | Alternate | Jeff              | Schneider        |            |            |            |            |                        |             |             |            |            |            |            |            |
|                    |             | Ridge Civic Association  | Member    | Pat               | Henagan          |            |            | P          |            |                        |             |             |            |            |            |            |            |
|                    |             | Science & Technology (added 1/13/05)   | Member    | Iqbal             | Chaudhry         |            | P          | P          | P          | P                      |             |             |            |            |            |            |            |
|                    |             | Town of Brookhaven (Graves made member 6/06)   | Member    | Anthony           | Graves           | P          | P          | P          | P          |                        |             |             |            |            |            |            |            |
|                    |             | Town of Brookhaven   | Alternate | None              | None             |            |            |            |            |                        |             |             |            |            |            |            |            |
|                    |             | Town of Brookhaven, Senior Citizens  | Member    | James             | Heil             | P          | P          | P          | P          |                        |             |             |            |            |            |            |            |
|                    |             | Town of Brookhaven, Senior Citizens (open slot as of 4/99)                               | Alternate | None              | None             |            |            |            |            |                        |             |             |            |            |            |            |            |
|                    |             | Town of Riverhead  | Member    | Robert            | Conklin          |            |            |            |            |                        |             |             |            |            |            |            |            |
|                    |             | Town of Riverhead (K. Skinner alternate as of 4/99)                                      | Alternate | Kim               | Skinner          |            |            |            |            |                        |             |             |            |            |            |            |            |
|                    |             | Wading River Civic Association   | Member    | Helga             | Guthy            |            | P          | P          | P          |                        |             |             |            |            |            |            |            |
|                    |             | Wading River Civic Association   | Alternate | Sid               | Bail             |            |            |            |            |                        |             |             |            |            |            |            |            |