

**Community Advisory Council
October 8, 2015
Action Items/Notes**

Final

These notes are in the following order:

1. Attendance
2. Correspondence and Handouts
3. Administrative Items
4. 2014 Annual Site Environmental Report
5. Agenda Setting
6. Community Comment
7. 2016 Five-Year Review / CAC Survey Questions

1. Attendance

Members/Alternates Present: See Attached Sheets.

Others Present: S. Bogart, W. Dorsch, L. Garber, D. Gibbs, Dr. M. Gonzalez, T. Green, R. Howe, S. Johnson, H. Kahnhauser, D. Manning, M. Maraviglia, D. Paquette, V. Racaniello, R. Reeder, J. Remien, N. Sundin, R. Turk

2. Correspondence and Handouts

Items numbered one through three were mailed to Members with a cover letter dated October 1, 2015. Items numbered four through six were available as handouts at the meeting.

1. Draft agenda for October 8, 2015
2. Draft notes from the September 10, 2015 meeting
3. Corrected copy of organizational category breakdown
4. Copies of the 2014 Annual Site Environmental Report (SER)
5. 2014 Annual SER presentation
6. 2016 Five-Year Review / CAC Survey Questions presentation

3. Administrative Items

The meeting was called to order at 6:32 PM. Reed Hodgkin, facilitator, welcomed everyone to the October meeting. He reviewed the ground rules and the draft agenda and those present introduced themselves. BNL Director Doon Gibbs shared the story behind his new tie; the pattern is of one of the first images taken at the NSLS-II.

CAC Member Iqbal Chaudhry announced that this was his last meeting as he and his family would be moving to Florida at the end of the month. He said how much he had enjoyed participating on the CAC and how much knowledge he had gotten from the experience. Reed said that the CAC also benefited by his participation and on behalf of the CAC said he would be missed and wished him well.

Hodgkin announced that there was a replacement for Pat Henagan from the Ridge Civic Association; Wesley Chattaway would now be representing them and he acknowledged that Catherine Mack was attending as the Alternate for the East Yaphank Civic Association.

Member Heil reported that he had read an article in his local paper, the Community Journal, about changes to standards used by the Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC) that might result in changes to the cleanup at BNL. He was concerned about whether or not the information in the article was correct. Reed said the CAC had taken up issues like this, the no threshold vs hormesis, previously and if they wanted to go into it in more depth it could be placed on a future agenda. Tonight, Henry Kahnhauser, BNL Radiation Protection Division, will give the short answer.

Kahnhauser said that this was an action in the Federal Register for the NRC to consider some petitions for changes. He said Brookhaven is a DOE site; actions by the Nuclear Regulatory Commission have no jurisdiction on any DOE sites or on EPA regulations.

Hodgin asked if that answered the question. Member Heil said it did. Hodgin reiterated that the standards that Brookhaven works off of for cleanup are established by the DOE, EPA, and the State of New York not by the NRC so this does not apply to the Laboratory.

Hodgin asked if the CAC had any questions or comments and if they wanted to pursue the issue further at another time.

Member Garber asked if a Record of Decision took precedence over a rule change. Reed said yes it would, that's a good point. (Editor's Note: Changes to standards is a topic that may be discussed and evaluated in CERCLA Five-Year Reviews.)

Member Shea said she feels it is an important issue and said the community looks to the Lab for scientific information so she thought it would be useful to have a meeting that discusses this issue.

Member Peskin said that from time to time people write unpleasant articles for lots of reasons; he thought in general a lot of effort would be spent mounting a defense for each one and said we should wait to see if any ripples occur.

Member Martin asked if the person identified in the article as having a post at Brookhaven was still an employee and what sort of research he is doing presently? That might be another reason for the CAC to get involved.

Action Item: Find out if Dr. Feinendegen is still on staff and what research he is doing.

Member Sprintzen said we did have a session ten or so years ago with four presenters, two talked about the benefits of low-level radiation and two speakers argued against it. Maybe it's appropriate to revisit that. The point is it may be desirable to have a serious discussion.

Reed said the topic would be listed in the Agenda Setting exercise so the CAC could decide if they want to address that general topic as we go forward. The question that Member Heil asked has been answered.

Member Guthy said she would like the Lab write what they were just told so that she could send it to the paper so that people could read that it does not apply to Brookhaven Lab.

Member Shea asked if the Lab was taking background radiation samples as well as samples to look at radiation from the site itself.

Remien said that he would be speaking about that during the SER presentation. The Lab Director said the answer was yes.

New Member Wesley Chattaway, Ridge Civic Association, introduced himself.

Approval of Minutes

Hodgin asked for corrections, additions, or deletions to the September 10 draft notes. Member Ziems asked that Dr. Castro's name be corrected from Mario to Maria. The notes were approved as amended, with none opposed, and seven abstentions.

4. Annual 2014 Site Environmental Report

Jason Remien, Manager, Environmental Protection Division, reported on the purpose of the Annual SER, listed the presentations that his division has given the CAC during the year to keep them informed, discussed the recommendations from the June EMS audit, and talked about the P2 program. He described Brookhaven's waste generation, energy management and conservation efforts including the Utility Energy Service Contract. He said that Brookhaven must comply with 36 permits and NEPA; two were renewed in 2014. He said there were 11 reportable spills and discussed potable water usage and water quality monitoring. He described EPA and NYSDEC inspections and assessments and talked about radiological and non-radiological air quality. Remien also told the CAC about the radiological dose assessment for 2014.

CAC members asked questions about P2 cost avoidance, if waste generation charts by year are available, what year the BGGR was taken apart, trends in radioactive waste generation, the spills that occurred onsite, if there were any radiological spills (no, there were not), who reviews the NEPA forms (project managers complete the forms, the DOE, who administers NEPA under federal law, make the determinations). Members also asked about exceedances of mercury, clarification of what past activities caused mercury releases (broken thermometers, various pumps, and mercury in sink drains in some labs), what inspections mean in terms of manpower and peoplepower for the Lab (typically three or four staff members accompany the inspectors for a half to a full day), natural background radiation levels (covered in Chapter 4, page 4-4; NYSDOH surveillance website <https://health.data.ny.gov/>, EPA Rad-Air monitoring station in Yaphank (<http://www2.epa.gov/radnet/radnet-near-real-time-air-monitoring-results-yaphank-ny>), what is the purpose of BLIP and how is the increase of radionuclides accounted for (the Brookhaven Linac Isotope Producer produces medical isotopes, the increase or decrease of emissions depends on the length of time the facility is run), ambient air monitoring (ambient air is monitored at stations at the perimeter of the Lab), and if there were plans to expand BLIP's production capacity (BNL is in the process of updating the Environmental Assessment for the continued operation and upgrade to the Collider-Accelerator Division which BLIP is in so there are some plans for that and we will be talking to you about them).

Member Esposito commented that if there were problems with the Sewage Treatment Plant that perhaps the Lab could consider some of the new technologies that others are using for denitrification.

5. Agenda Setting

Nora Sundin said that in November there would be the Annual Groundwater Report from Bill Dorsch, an update on the Peconic River, and an agenda setting exercise. In December, someone from the Central Pine Barrens Commission will be here to talk about the Community Wildfire Protection Plan being prepared for Ridge, Manorville, and Calverton.

Community Comment

Hodgin asked for comments from the community. There were none.

6. 2016 Five-Year Review / CAC Survey Questions

Bob Howe, Groundwater Protection Group, described the purpose and process for the CERCLA Five-Year Review which will be completed in the fall of 2016. The Review is required by EPA as long as there are contaminants remaining onsite above levels that don't allow unrestricted use of the site. He explained what would be covered by the Review and discussed the previous two Reviews which took place in 2006 and 2011.

He showed a short EPA youtube video –
Getting to Know the Five-Year Review, A Guide for Communities Near Federal Facilities –
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=VquoeVT4FjI>

Howe said that this Review will evaluate all the cleanup remedies for the site and assess their protectiveness to ensure that cleanup goals will be met. The areas of particular focus during this Review would be elevated Sr-90 in groundwater at the Former Hazardous Waste Management Facility, possible continuing sources of Sr-90 at the BGRR, former Waste Concentration Facility, and the Chemical Holes that is impacting system shut down, and the elevated mercury in Peconic River sediment at Area WC-06. Howe went over the next steps which include input from the CAC and interviews with members of the Brookhaven Executive Roundtable (BER), regulators, and elected officials. He said he would update the CAC in the late spring.

Member Chattaway asked for an explanation of a bioshield.

Member Garber asked if the BER is providing input. (Yes, a few of the members will be interviewed.)

Reed explained that there were four survey questions being asked of the CAC and that members should give their input and that it was okay to repeat responses as they would be attributed to each member individually. Everyone will have a chance to give input on each of the questions.

1. What is your overall impression of BNL's cleanup and do you feel well informed about the cleanup activities and progress?

Member Peskin, Brookhaven Retired Employee's Association, said his impression of the cleanup is extremely positive and he feels quite well informed about the activities and progress. He said he has been on the CAC as a member or alternate for about 10 years. Prior to that he was a stakeholder as an employee, he remembers the bad ole days when a group like this was sorely needed, he said the information flow is vital, these are no longer the bad ole days and said the Lab should be commended for the support they gave the CAC and the community in general.

Member Talbot, Middle Island Civic Association, said BNL's cleanup is and has been a central activity of attention to all operating departments. A large and continuing effort has been in place to keep the status of the cleanup in the forefront.

Member Kaplan asked how many members gave their input in writing because he didn't want to repeat anything he had written.

Reed said that if members had provided written comments they will be incorporated. If you have not provided written comments, tonight is your chance to give your first comments.

Member Chaudhry said he thinks there should be more of a focus on radioactivity and radionuclides and cleanup associated with them as opposed to the nonradioactive substances.

Member Sprintzen, Long Island Progressive Coalition, said excellent and yes!

2. Are there any specific aspects of the cleanup that you feel should be of particular focus during the review? (e.g. RODs, cleanup goals, community input, etc.)

Member Esposito, Citizens Campaign for the Environment, said just to make sure her comments were received, the 70-year timeline for Sr-90 plume that she is still unhappy about,

since we have several years of monitoring, should be looked at to see if it can be shortened to less than 70 years. That was the longest remediation timeline that we approved for any of the areas at BNL so we should look at current and new data to see if it can be shortened. The timeline for the High Flux Beam Reactor, should also be looked at to see if that can be shortened. She said we should not leave this for the next generation. She also wanted to focus on new technologies for denitrification for the sewage treatment plant.

Member Muether, Long Island Pine Barrens Society, asked if there was some kind of a report that compared what the CAC recommended and voted on for the cleanup many years ago and compared that to what was really done showing details about how the costs compared, time spent, and the degree of the cleanup. She wondered if there was a comparison done on the recommendations the CAC voted on.

Sundin said that that was an exercise that was already done, we'd be happy to provide you with the information again.

Member Murdocco, Teachers Federal Credit Union, thinks it's important to keep a focus on making sure that, since the Lab is a science facility, it is easy to get lost and spiral down into a well of jargon and terms that the public isn't that familiar with outside of this group, make sure to keep that focus because it will be key for stakeholder relations.

Sundin said that a new member orientation meeting would be scheduled to learn about the cleanup history and where we were and where we are now.

Member Esposito added that she thinks that the Lab also needs to begin looking at the Medical Reactor as there is not yet a D&D process established for it.

Remien said that it was not part of the CERCLA program, but we have been performing risk reduction activities. The actual D&D of the reactor itself is something that we are keeping track of and when funding is available we will address it.

Reed said that the comment would be captured as part of this even though it is not a current site under CERCLA. It's a comment that was captured. He will also take it as a request as part of the CAC process to report on what's being done about the Medical Reactor.

3. Do you feel confident in BNL and DOE's management of the long-term cleanup operations for the site?

Member Kaplan, Friends of Brookhaven, said BNL has demonstrated to us the confidence in their management of the long-term clean-up. It's hard to say anything about DOE because to the best of my recollection we haven't been given as many presentations by DOE people here at the CAC concerning their input. You might say if I'm confident about BNL then by default one would be confident about BSA and DOE, however speaking for myself, I don't feel that I could definitively give any comment about DOE's role and that's why I asked at our last meeting to see more input from DOE and from the regulators.

Reed asked if it was from a lack of information that he was not in position to answer that question.

Kaplan said he'd like to have had more input from DOE, who do they use, do they have in house people, do they contract out for their reviews of various reports that BNL provides, what type of person, what type of qualifications do these people have, that sort of thing.

Member Peskin said that you can only feel as confident as you are that you know who the management of the site will be. Directors change, strategic documents change. There was even

a time when DOE didn't exist but Brookhaven Lab did. So you can't feel too confident because things can change, hopefully, for the better but you don't know.

Member Chaudhry said he might not agree with Member Kaplan regarding the DOE, he gives them credit for what they are supposed to be doing. They are a management entity, not implementing entity really, so they stay in the background. He gave a 9 out of 10 to BNL and DOE.

Member Heil, Town of Brookhaven Senior Citizens, said over the past few years BNL management has certainly earned our confidence and maybe along the same way DOE also because certainly BNL can't do much beyond the DOE approvals and funding. It's hard to predict the future. Changes of administration, changes of theories of life in the US, how future funding and availability of personnel, all those things that make up the program, how will they evolve, will they be there in the same way, hopefully it will continue, but it's always subject to change.

Karen Blumer said apparently DOE is really competent and diligent, however, in terms of trust and working or getting input from them here, we've noticed that everything is kept separate. Even on the nuclear discussion tonight everything is separated. So their performance on projects that we have seen and experienced here, input on the NEPA forms for example, our input was dismissed, therefore, our confidence level is shaken.

4. Do you have any comments, suggestions, or recommendations regarding BNL / DOE's management and communications of the cleanup?

Karen Blumer said she'd like to see a chart showing a summary of the progress overtime for all the cleanup projects so that it's not fragmented, so you can get a whole concept of what's happening. An easy chart that can be referred to. Progress was defined as where we are, as compared to where we were in the beginning.

Member Carlin, Huntington Breast Cancer Coalition, said he always felt like the website materials are organized for engineers and that's not for most people, it's easy to get lost. He'd like to see a high-level overview for the general public of all the different cleanup and oversight kinds of things happening at the Lab and liked what Member Blumer had said.

Member Martin also seconded Member Blumer's request for a chronological chart possibly broken down into different areas.

The Agenda Setting Exercise was postponed until next month.

The meeting adjourned at 9:07 PM.

Next meeting: November 12, 2015.

CAC Agenda Setting – May 8, 2014

PRESENTATIONS

- Pros & Cons of Bringing Back Commercial Nuclear Power – 12 (10/9/14 Bill Horak)
- Holographic Principles of Quantum Mechanics – 8
- Biological Research at BNL – 7 (5/14/15 C.J. Liu)
- The Gamma Forest (where was it onsite; the kind of research done there) - 7
- Survey of all DOE Labs – 6 (9/11/14- Frank Crescenzo)
- Climate Science & W.H. Report (Steve Schwartz) – 5
- NASA Research – 5
- Waste Minimization at BNL – 5 (1/8/15 Peter Pohlot)
- Update on Battery Storage – 5
- More History – 4
- Economic Impact of the Lab - 4
- Nanotech Research, Safety, Environment, Ethics – 4
- Fukushima – 4
- Update on LI Solar Farm (production, environment) – 4
- Research / Trends on Wildlife on LI – 3
- Non Proliferation – 3
- Patents & Commercialization – Pros & Cons of Science vs. Commercialization – 3 (6/11/15 Connie Cleary)
- Update of Tick-borne Diseases – 3
- Electric Grid (by J. Misewich) – 3
- Update on G-2 – 3
- Invite HS Students to Speak on Their Topics – 3
- Update on State Program for Carbon Footprint Reduction (80x50?) – 2
- Research towards Sustainability – 2
- STEM Research Update (InSynC) – 2
- Computer Facility for LHC/ATLAS / RHIC – 2
- Research by Students at NSLS – Reach Out Program – 1

TOURS

- ISB – 3 (6/12/2014)

				Jan	Feb cancel	Mar	Apr	May	June	July No mtg	Aug No mtg	Sep	Oct	Nov	Dec
P = Present	2015	Affiliation	Member	First Name	Last Name										
		ABCO – Civic (Garber - 04/02) (Bevington – 6/14) (Keenan-10/14)	Member	Ray	Keenan	P		P	P	P			P	P	
		(Madigan -10/10)	Alternate	Michael	Madigan				P	P					
		American Physical Society – Business & Labor	Member	Reinhart	Schuhmann	P		P		P	P		P	P	
		(Schuhmann 1/14, member 9/15)	Alternate												
		Brookhaven Coalition of Chambers of Commerce – Bus & Labor (added 6/15)	Member	Ron	Trotta					P			P	P	
		Brookhaven Retired Employees Association- BNL (Peskin - 09/09)	Member	Arnie	Peskin	P		P		P	P			P	
		(Franz - 12/09)	Alternate	Eena-Mai	Franz	P		P	P		P				
		(Shapiro-1/13)	Alternate	Steve	Shapiro								P		
		Citizens Campaign for the Environment – Advocacy & Environ	Member	Adrienne	Esposito	P		P		P	P			P	
			Alternate												
		Colonial Woods Whispering Pines – Civic (Birben - 06/09) (O'Neal 01/15 removed 10/15)	Member	Gathy	O'Neal	P		P		P					
		(Rehbein -11/10)	Alternate	Eric	Rehbein				P		P		P		
		Coram Civic Association (Ziems - 06/12)	Member	Paul	Ziems	P		P	P	P	P		P	P	
		(Meade – 06/12, Jim M 10/12)	Alternate	Jim	Meade										
		East Yaphank Civic Association	Member	Michael	Giacomaro	P		P	P	P	P		P		
		(Feinman - 02/09)	Alternate	Bob	Feinman	P		P							
			Alternate	Catherine	Mack									P	
		Emeritus (added 12/14)	Member	Don	Garber	P		P	P	P	P			P	
		Emeritus (changed 3/8/12)	Member	Jean	Mannhaupt										
		Foundation for Economic Education – Ed, Sci, & Tech (5/14)(Martin – 10/14)	Member	Bruce	Martin			P	P	P	P		P	P	
		(Edwards – 10/14)	Alternate	Estelle	Edwards										
		(Pratka – 10/14)	Alternate	Craig	Pratka	P				P	P			P	
		Friends of Brookhaven- BNL (Kaplan - 07/01)	Member	Ed	Kaplan			P			P		P	P	
		(Schwartz - 11/02)	Alternate	Steve	Schwartz	P		P		P					
		Huntington Breast Cancer Coalition – Health-Based Rep	Member	Mary Joan	Shea	P		P		P	P			P	
			Alternate	Scott	Carlin									P	
		Individual (changed 3/12)	Member	Karen	Blumer			P	P	P	P			P	
		(added 6/12)	Alternate	Michael	Madigan	P		P						P	
		Individual – (changed 3/12)	Member	Jane	Corrarino			P		P					
			Alternate												
		Individual – (changed 3/12)(moved 10/15 last mtg)	Member	Iqbal	Chaudhry	P		P			P			P	

				Jan	Feb cancel	Mar	Apr	May	June	July No mtg	Aug No mtg	Sep	Oct	Nov	Dec
P = Present	2015	Affiliation	First Name	Last Name											
								P							
		L.I. Pine Barrens Society – Advoc & Env (Murdocco - 04/11, deleted 6/12) (Muller added – 8/12)(Katie Rose Leonard added – 6/13)(Muether added – 5/15)	Member	Richard	Amper			P							
			Alternate	Katie	Muether		P	P	P	P		P	P		
		L.I. Progressive Coalition – Advoc & Env	Member	David	Sprintzen	P	P	P		P		P	P		
			Alternate												
		Lake Panamoka Civic Association (Biss - 04/02) (Grandal - 10/10)	Member	Rita	Biss	P		P		P		P	P		
			Alternate	Bonita	Grandal	P				P		P	P		
		Longwood Central School Dist. – Ed, Sci, & Tech (Castro -06/09)(adams 9/15) (Gerstenlauer removed & Sterne added 5/14 removed 9/15)	Member	Tracy	Adams	P	P					P			
			Alternate												
		Mastic Park Civic Association (Sicignano – 6/12)	Member	John	Sicignano	P	P		P	P					
			Alternate	Clara	McManus										
			Alternate	Joe	May							P			
		Middle Island Civic Association (Nowak 01/15 – 5/15)(Malloy 9/15)	Member	Tom	Talbot	P				P		P	P		
			Alternate	Margaret	Malloy	P	P	P	P						
		NSLS-II User Committee – BNL (Ravel -02/11-9/15)	Member	Jean	Jordan-Sweet			P	P	P		P			
			Alternate			P									
		Ridge Civic Association (Henagan removed 9/15)(Chattaway added 10/15)	Member	Wesley	Chattaway	P	P	P	P	P			P		
		Suffolk County Legislature 1st Dist. - Government (added 6/15)	Member	Al	Krupski					P		P	P		
			Alternate	John	Stype										
		Teachers Federal Credit Union – Bus & Labor (Murdocco 3/15)	Member	Richard	Murdocco		P		P	P		P	P		
			Alternate	Suzanne	Gillan					P					
		Town of Brookhaven (Graves – 06/06)-(removed 1/2015)	Member	Anthony	Graves										
			Alternate												
		Town of Brookhaven, Senior Citizens Office - Government	Member	James	Heil	P	P	P	P	P		P	P		
			Alternate												
		Town of Riverhead - Government (Doroski - 04/11) (Hulme - 04/11 - 4/14)	Member	Isidore	Doroski	P	P		P	P		P			
			Alternate												
		Wading River Civic Association	Member	Helga	Guthy	P	P	P	P	P		P	P		
			Alternate	Sid	Bail										